

# **Fact versus Fiction: Comparing Primary and Secondary Sources about Christopher Columbus and the Colonization of the New World With a New Perspective on Thanksgiving**

*Kathleen Radebaugh  
Henry C. Lea Elementary*

**Overview**

**Rationale**

**Objectives**

**Strategies**

**Unit One: Analysis and Evaluation of Perspectives about Christopher Columbus**

**Unit Two: Analysis and Evaluation of Perspectives about Thanksgiving**

**Unit Three: Here and Now of Native American culture and Activism**

**Annotated Bibliography**

**Resources**

**Appendix**

**Content Standards**

**Overview**

“In 1492 Columbus sailed the ocean blue.” What happens after that is not part of the nursery rhyme. Students in class will read two to three primary sources from Columbus’ diary and the diary of Christian ministers that explain the first impressions of the indigenous people and how colonies treated the Native Americans. There are examples of pure abuse, genocide, and dehumanization of the Native Americans. Once the students are done analyzing and evaluating their viewpoints about the primary sources, they will read secondary sources from their history textbook and articles praising and acclaiming the sense of “discovery” attributed to Christopher Columbus from various time periods. Primary and secondary sources can be criticized for its validity and students will read speeches from former presidents praising and degrading the acts of Christopher Columbus. The students will constantly ask themselves, what is true and what is false and how do we know the difference?

The same formula will follow for the discussion of Thanksgiving and its origin. What is the truth about Thanksgiving and how has the truth evolved (some might say dissolved) over time? I honestly believe that many students (like myself when I first started researching this topic) will be shocked. What will happen to us as observers of this holiday when we discover the truth of its origin? Does the less the importance of family coming together? Should we not celebrate this holiday? How can my students express their new-found knowledge into a form of activism? I am eager to see how my students

respond to this unit and I am very excited to see what forms of activism and awareness they will want to pursue. My students are very creative. They are very good questioners.

## **Rationale**

My reasons for creating this unit are very simple. Firstly, I wanted to develop a unit in which I continue to learn along with my students an aspect of this course I found most fascinating. Our first book was *Everything You Wanted to Know About Indians, but Were Afraid to Ask* by Anton Treuer. I love this book. Treuer is an exceptional writer with very clear cut answers, yet they are many times he mentions in his writings that there isn't one consistent thought shared by Native Americans just like everything else in life. I like how Treuer lets the reader decide what they think about many of the cultural aspects surrounding the Native American culture. That is what I want to create for my students. I want to present them with new and provocative information surrounding cultural ideals that many of us take for granted.

Throughout our course, every researcher, author, artist, and educator presented us with fascinating and new perspectives on the Native American culture. Every part of this course was designed to present us with new information and new perspectives which allowed us to question and dig deeper. There were many presenters that talked to us for a couple minutes and the rest of time we asked questions. I would like to do the same. I would like to present primary and secondary sources about Christopher Columbus and Thanksgiving and let my students develop their viewpoints. Once they read more, discuss, share, and analyze the impact of these documents, both primary and secondary, they will have to decide what to do next. I will support them in finding avenues that will allow them to advocate their new understandings.

This is exactly what occurred at the "Teachers Institute of Philadelphia." Professor Williams presented us with exceptional speakers and advocates for Native Americans and their culture and then we developed a unit based on what we thought was important.

We celebrate Thanksgiving and its connection to the pilgrims treatment of Native Americans. There is no document that says there was ever a meal between pilgrims and Native Americans. There are many primary sources, like letters and journals by Bartolome de las Casas who accompanied Christopher Columbus in his voyages that describe mass murder, burning of villages, and slaughter of women and children. This unit will compare and contrast primary and secondary sources about Christopher Columbus and his exploration of the New World. The students will decipher fact versus fiction and develop a means to help resolve this misconception of Christopher Columbus and other explorers of the New World.

## **Objectives**

This unit is intended for seventh or eighth grade students. I will explain to the students that some of the primary sources chosen are intended for the viewer. I do not want to read with students very graphic primary sources that do exist. I will select sources that portray the same message of betrayal and abuse of the Native Americans by European explorers, especially Christopher Columbus. The unit will last two to three weeks depending on writing and reading schedule with 90 minute classes every day. Always, students will have access to technology, their guided reading groups, and after school tutoring.

- Students will be able to determine and interpret the meaning of unfamiliar words
- Students will be able to analyze the author's use of figurative language, to determine meaning and assess the impact on the overall text.
- Students will be able to determine and analyze the main idea of informational pieces both primary and secondary sources in order to provide an objective summary
- Students will be able to compare and contrast primary and secondary sources that share a common purpose or main idea
- Students will be able to read independently for 30 to 35 minutes in order to develop RITUAL
- Students will be able to develop, explore, and argue a solution to many Americans understanding of Christopher Columbus and other explorers in the 1460-1500s or the purpose and perspective of Thanksgiving in a persuasive essay and other means of communication
- Students will be able to analyze and evaluate the central idea in order to draw conclusions and inferences about Native American culture today in the Delaware Valley

### **Strategies**

- Students will be able to determine and interpret the meaning of unfamiliar words
  - a. Previewing vocabulary and cultural references before reading the text (before reading strategy) Teacher will preview the texts with the students. This means that the teacher will select three to four unfamiliar words from the reading and review the meaning of those words even before the students begin to read the passage. This is called word study. For instance, students will define the words with a Frayer Model or a Tier I, Tier II, and Tier III chart to determine meaning.

b. During reading, students will highlight the unfamiliar words and write the meaning of the side

c. Post reading, students will incorporate one or two words from the meaning in a written reflective response to show meaning of the word and how it impacts the meaning of the work as a whole.

-Students will be able to analyze the author's use of figurative language, to determine meaning and assess the impact on the overall text.

a. Within many of the primary and secondary sources, the various author's use cadence, similes, metaphors, and other forms of figurative language that heighten the imagery and reflect the overall tone of the passage. Students will identify those use of figurative language and explain how the overall tone and meaning is impacted by this form of writing. Students will identify with textual evidence the use of figurative and then analyze its role in developing the central idea via notes, paragraphs, and/or graphic organizer.

--Students will be able to determine and analyze the main idea of informational pieces both primary and secondary sources in order to provide an objective summary

a. Within our literacy block, teacher will shared read (model reading out loud with interactive thinking) primary and secondary sources used in this unit. The teacher will highlight, write on the side, and draw conclusions based on the text. The teacher will model for the students a graphic organizer based on the interactions of the individual and the events that took place. Next, the teacher will then call upon student volunteers to read, share their highlights and thought process and conclusions based on the text. The students will collaborate with the teacher in completing a graphic organizer that analyzes the interactions of the individual and the events that took place. Then the students will work in cooperative pairs based on the students DRA reading level to complete the same standard and objectives. This will allow the teacher to determine which students need more small-group instruction based on the content and objective.

-Students will be able to compare and contrast primary and secondary sources that share a common purpose or main idea

a. During one or two Writing Workshops, students will be able to compare and contrast primary and secondary sources about one particular topic, Christopher Columbus and/or Thanksgiving. This will be a formal

writing assignment for their writing portfolio. It is not the culminating assessment for this unit, but an authentic writing assessment that will entail prewriting, revisions, and peer review and feedback activities. Students will be able to brainstorm their stance on one topic and develop that topic with textual evidence and analysis. Students will then review and revise their writing with their cooperative pairs and turn in a published three-paragraph essay. Standard PSSA rubric will be used to score the writing.

-Students will be able to read independently for 30 to 35 minutes in order to develop RITUAL

a. The students take part in a school-wide initiative called RITUAL. This occurs once a week for 30 to 35 minutes. The students read independently a book from their choosing or based on the teacher's recommendations for the unit. In this unit, the students will read one of the following books, *Walk Two Moons* by Sharon Creech, *The Education of Little Tree* by Asa Earl Carter, or *The Absolutely True Diary of a Part Time Indian* by Sherman Alexie. It is important that a student selects a book based on reading level. It is important to balance informational and literary text within a unit. The students will be assessed on this book based on discussions that take place in reading circles and reading the book in class for 30 to 35 minutes every Thursday. Each child within the School District of Philadelphia has a library card. Student can utilize the local library within their community. Teacher can call in advance to the local branch and reserve the copies for the students.

-Students will be able to develop, explore, and argue a solution to many Americans (Philadelphia based) about their understanding of Christopher Columbus and other explorers in the 1460-1500s and/or the celebration and observance of Thanksgiving in a persuasive essay and other means of communication

a. This is the culminating assessment for this unit. Students can choose their choice board assessment. The choice board assessment will be outlined in the content standards section of this paper. Students can choose whether or not they will advocate for change, removal, editing the observance of Christopher Columbus holiday, Thanksgiving holiday, or any other possible topic that could emerge while completing this unit with your students. Every classroom is unique and topics and themes will emerge that students will want to explore and research. Teachers should set a standard and use the PSSA rubric for projects and assignments, but allow the students to select one argument and one avenue for communicating that argument. It could be a letter to their local

Congressman. Students can choose to edit and produce a video tutorial, start a local petition around their neighborhood, or write an argumentative essay. Each assessment will address the standards of the unit and will be developed in adherence to the PSSA rubric.

## **Unit One: Analysis and Evaluation of Perspectives about Christopher Columbus**

Monday

Objective: Students will be able to determine and interpret the meaning of unfamiliar words

Objective: Students will be able to determine and analyze the main idea of informational pieces both primary and secondary sources in order to provide an objective summary

A. Do Now: Activate Prior Knowledge: Complete a word association map based on two concepts: stereotypes and reputation

B. Check for Understanding: Display teacher model of word association map for the two concepts and discuss how these two themes will be discussed throughout the course of the unit. Introduce the unit with two quotes from Native American tribal members.

*Luther Standing Bear Oglala Sioux 1868*

*The American Indian is of the soil, whether it be the region of forests, plains, pueblos, or mesas. He fits into the landscape, for the hand that fashioned the continent also fashioned the man for his surroundings. He once grew as naturally as the wild sunflowers, he belongs just as the buffalo belonged....*

*Eagle Chief (Letakos-Lesa) Pawnee*

*All things in the world are two. In our minds we are two, good and evil. With our eyes we see two things, things that are fair and things that are ugly.... We have the right hand that strikes and makes for evil, and we have the left hand full of kindness, near the heart. One foot may lead us to an evil way, the other foot may lead us to a good. So are all things two, all two.*

Have students discuss with their cooperative partner (partner that is assigned to them based on formative assessment) and determine the central meaning of the quote and its relation to what they know or perceive about the Native American culture and history. Ask for students to share their discussions to the class.

C. Introduction of New Material: Teacher introduces this three part unit: Christopher Columbus, Thanksgiving, and the Here and Now of Native American culture in relation to activism. Throughout the entire unit, teacher will emphasize that this does not define the culture or heritage of a Native American, but are two common misconceptions and prejudices that need to be addressed in today's society. Teacher hands out pgs 50-53 of

Chapter One, Section Five of “Early European Explorers” in *Creating America, A History of the United States*. Teacher shared reads excerpt and models 7.2b graphic organizer with the students.

D. Collaborate with Teacher: Student volunteers read a new passage from social studies textbook and collaborates with teacher and class in completing graphic organizer. Teacher shows video from the History.com entitled “The First Americans” and completes the third column of the graphic organizer with student volunteers.

E. Exit Ticket: Why do you think Ms. Radebaugh started the unit with a selection from your history textbook? Go back to the Do Now and purpose for this unit.

\*It is important to start the unit with examples from their everyday life so they will have a starting point. They students will not realize until the third part of the unit when they revisit the chapter within their Social Studies textbook and compare what they know now to what they knew before entering the unit. Hopefully the students can see that the textbook is underwritten and develops a bias.

F. Homework: Students need to be prepared for their independent reading for Thursday. The students read independently a book from their choosing or based on the teacher’s recommendations for the unit. In this unit, the students will read one of the following books, *Walk Two Moons* by Sharon Creech, *The Education of Little Tree Book* by Asa Earl Carter, or *The Absolutely True Diary of a Part Time Indian* by Sherman Alexie. The student can find these books at their local library. Each student at our school has a library card given to them by the Free Public Library.

Tuesday

Objective: Students will be able to determine and interpret the meaning of unfamiliar words

Objective: Students will be able to determine and analyze the main idea of informational pieces both primary and secondary sources in order to provide an objective summary

A. Do Now: Activate prior knowledge: Define “indigenous”

B. Check for understanding: in·dig·e·nous (phonetic approach to word meaning: break down the components of the word in order to determine meaning)

C. Word Study: Preview of text: Pull lines from *Everything You Wanted to Know About Native Americans but Were Afraid to Ask* by Anton Treuer

“Bartolome de las Casas estimated that the **indigenous** population of Espanola, now known as Hispaniola, island of Haiti and the Dominican Republic, was two million people.” (pg 15-16)

“**Archaeological** evidence confirms that the capital city of the Aztec Empire was three times larger than the largest city in all of Western Europe at the time.” (pg 16)

“This theory of human origin in the Americas (usually called the **Clovis First Theory**) is now widely challenged in the scientific community.” (pg 17)

D. Word Study Check for Understanding: Select one of the vocabulary words and complete a Frayer Model for the word in order to the student to analyze and interpret its meaning.

E. Shared Reading of pgs 15-16 of *Everything You Wanted to Know About Native Americans but Were Too Afraid to Ask* by Anton Treuer. Students listen along with the teacher while he or she reads the pages out loud for the class. The teacher will stop and text decode: highlight topic sentences and main ideas, write notes on the side, and model looking up a word from our preview of text.

F. Collaborate with Teacher pgs 16-17 of *Everything You Wanted to Know About Native Americans but Were Afraid to Ask* by Anton Treuer. Teacher calls on student volunteers to read aloud a passage and the teacher asks the student what he or she would highlight and write on the side based on what was read. Then the teacher and class will transition to 7.2 graphic organizer and complete the graphic organizer together.

E. Exit Ticket: Why is it important for us to understand the meaning of “indigenous” and when the Native Americans were in North America?



Wednesday

Objective: Students will be able to determine and interpret the meaning of unfamiliar words

Objective: Students will be able to determine and analyze the main idea of informational pieces both primary and secondary sources in order to provide an objective summary

A. Do Now: Text decoding: Who is Cristoforo Columbo?

B. Collaborate with Teacher: pgs 25-26 of *Everything You Wanted to Know About Native Americans but Were Afraid to Ask* by Anton Treuer. Teacher calls on student volunteers to read aloud a passage and the teacher asks the student what he or she would highlight and write on the side based on what was read. Then the teacher and class will transition to 7.2 graphic organizer and complete the graphic organizer together.

C. Cooperative Pairs and Small Group Instruction with Teacher: Cooperative Pairs are determined by the teacher because students need to work with a peer that is on the same reading level. Teacher has to modify the reading selections from the students based on their reading levels. Students on reading level with will pgs 27-28 of *Everything You Wanted to Know About Native Americans but Were Afraid to Ask* by Anton Treuer. Students on reading level are expected to complete 7.2 graphic organizer with cooperative pair. Students who are one grade below reading level will read two to three excerpts from Christopher Columbus' journal. These excerpts will be presented in packet with guided reading questions. Students who are two grades below reading level will work with teacher. Teacher will show them a current map of the Atlantic Ocean and draw for them Christopher Columbus' path. It is ideal for a teacher to use a globe to show that North America and South America was in the path of Columbus' voyage to India. If there is time in the small group instruction, teacher will read with students one of the first excerpts from Columbus's journal.

E. Exit Ticket: Argue if you think Christopher Columbus knew what he was doing the moment he left Spain. Do you think he was out to conquer land or just find gold? Do you think he was pressured by his peers to capture the Native Americans or do you think he saw their weakness right away?

F. Homework: Students need to be prepared for their independent reading for Thursday. The students read independently a book from their choosing or based on the teacher's recommendations for the unit. In this unit, the students will read one of the following books, *Walk Two Moons* by Sharon Creech, *The Education of Little Tree Book* by Asa Earl Carter, or *The Absolutely True Diary of a Part Time Indian* by Sherman Alexie. The student can find these books at their local library. Each student at our school has a library card given to them by the Free Public Library.

Thursday

Objective: Students will be able to read independently for 30 minutes in order to develop RITUAL

Objective: Students will be able to determine and analyze the main idea of informational pieces both primary and secondary sources in order to provide an objective summary

A. Do Now: Students will read their independent reading book for 30 minutes in order to develop RITUAL.

\*Students who do not have their independent reading book can read from their literature textbook. Teacher will have to seek further consequences for the student: assign a detention or call home so that student can be prepared for class.

B. Check for Understanding: Students complete RITUAL log in student binder.

C. Cooperative Pairs: Students will receive a packet of journals written by Christopher Columbus and Bartolome de las Casas. This packet includes a range of journal entries by Christopher Columbus when he was en route and once he arrived in the Bahamas. Since this is the first day the students are reading the journal entries, they can choose how they will analyze and process the entries. They can select with their partner one of the following: complete ten to 12 notes on a Cornell template, two to three sketches that represent two to three journal entries, or a word association map about Columbus and his viewpoint on the people and land.

D. While the students are working in cooperative pairs, teacher will work with a small group. Teacher rotates through the cooperative pairs and instructs the different between primary and secondary sources. Check in with the group to see how they are developing a viewpoint on Christopher Columbus and their thoughts about how he first came to meet the land and people.

E. Exit Ticket: Why does knowing the right story about Columbus matter?

F. Homework: Students to review and study notes from the week. Students need to study and review the objectives of this week. Students will continue to read one of the following books, *Walk Two Moons* by Sharon Creech, *The Education of Little Tree Book* by Asa Earl Carter, or *The Absolutely True Diary of a Part Time Indian* by Sherman Alexie.

Friday

Objective: Students will be able to analyze the author's use of figurative language, to determine meaning and assess the impact on the overall text.

Objective: Students will be able to determine and analyze the main idea of informational pieces both primary and secondary sources in order to provide an objective summary

A. Do Now: Make a prediction: Identify and argue the major difference between Columbus' first voyage and his second voyage to North America.

B. Check for Understanding: Identify and analyze some of the recurring themes of the first five journal entries pulled by teacher from the collection of journals by Christopher Columbus. Explain the reasoning for selecting these journals and that if students would like independent time reviewing all the journals themselves, teacher can provide time in class for independent study. These excerpts were selected because they show Columbus' thought process about the journey, the land, and the people.

C. Shared Reading of pgs 28-29 of *Everything You Wanted to Know About Native Americans but Were Afraid to Ask* by Anton Treuer. This section is about Columbus' second voyage and "Why does getting the Columbus story right matter?" During Shared Reading, teacher will highlight and make notes in the margin about the main ideas and Treuer's point of view of Columbus and how we teach Columbus to our children.

D. Collaborate with Teacher: Students will help teacher complete a T Chart based on the information provided for second voyage. During homework this evening, students will need to complete information about his first voyage through reading the collection of excerpts of Christopher's journal. Once T-chart is complete, teacher will call upon student volunteers to read pages 30-32 of *Everything You Wanted to Know About Native Americans but Were Afraid to Ask* by Anton Treuer.

E. Independent Journal Entry in Binder along with Exit Ticket: Based on your understanding of what we studied this week, why has the United States not formally apologized to the Native Americans and why do classrooms focus on "discover" and "new world" and not "genocide" and "murder"? Independently write in the classwork section of your binder for 10 minutes and brainstorm this topic-informal writing but you must provide supporting evidence.

F. Homework: Read and review the journal entries by Christopher Columbus and complete the T chart based on the difference between the first and second voyage of Columbus to North America. While you are reading your journal entries, highlight one or two main ideas per entry and write notes in the margin.

Monday

Objective: Students will be able to analyze the author's use of figurative language, to determine meaning and assess the impact on the overall text.

Objective: Students will be able to determine and analyze the main idea of informational pieces both primary and secondary sources in order to provide an objective summary

A. Do Now: Make a prediction: Identify and argue the major difference between Columbus' first voyage and his second voyage to North America.

B. Check for Understanding: Identify and analyze some of the recurring themes of the mid-October journal entries pulled by teacher from the collection of journals by Christopher Columbus. Explain the reasoning for selecting these journals and that if students would like independent time reviewing all the journals themselves, teacher can provide time in class for independent study. These excerpts were selected because they show Columbus' thought process about the journey, the land, and the people.

C. Shared Reading of pgs 32-33 of *Everything You Wanted to Know About Native Americans but Were Afraid to Ask* by Anton Treuer. This section is about Columbus' second voyage and "Why does getting the Columbus story right matter?" During Shared Reading, teacher will highlight and make notes in the margin about the main ideas and Treuer's point of view of Columbus and how we teach Columbus to our children.

D. Cooperative Pairs reading of an excerpt from Presidential Proclamation for Columbus Day by George Bush, Sr. In this excerpt, the students will analyze the use of figurative language, to determine meaning and assess the impact on the overall text. The teacher should also encourage the students to share their thoughts respectfully on the content of this speech in relation to what they just read on Friday about the mass killings of Native Americans due to Christopher Columbus's second voyage.

E. Collaborate with Teacher: Discussion based/quick survey of the room: Based on what your readings from today and the prior week, is President Bush correct? Should we have a Christopher Columbus Day? Why or why not?

F. Exit Ticket: Brainstorm two to three ways in which you think it would be best to share this new information you have regarding Christopher Columbus and some activist steps you would like to take to promote this new understanding.

F. Homework: Students will need to continue to review and study notes from the week. Students will continue to read their independent reading book for 30 to 35 minutes at night.

## Unit Two: Analysis and Evaluation of Perspectives about Thanksgiving

Tuesday

Objective: Students will be able to determine and interpret the meaning of unfamiliar words

Objective: Students will be able to determine and analyze the main idea of informational pieces both primary and secondary sources in order to provide an objective summary

A. Do Now: This whole unit on Fact versus Fiction: Comparing Primary and Secondary Sources is about determining truth and what to do when truth is revealed. What do you think is the truth about Thanksgiving?

B. Independent Practice: Students log onto a computer. Student goes to the following website <http://www.history.com/topics/thanksgiving> and spends time watching the videos on this public domain website. Please provide the student with headphones or allow the student to listen to the videos with headphones. While watching the videos, the student is taking notes either with Cornell note template or in their binder. Teacher can monitor the progress of students by walking around and writing down any questions the students might have after watching the video. Teacher can write down the questions on the board.

C. Collaborate with Teacher: Teacher and students discuss the videos and try to answer the questions proposed by students during the video. Teacher can transition to pg 34-35 of *Everything You Wanted to Know About Native Americans but Were Afraid to Ask* by Anton Treuer. Teacher calls upon student volunteers to read and share their highlights and notes in the margin. Teacher transitions for the last time and calls upon student volunteers to read the Joint Resolution that declares Thanksgiving a legal holiday the fourth Thursday of November.

D. Exit Ticket: Do you think we should still celebrate Thanksgiving? Why or why not?

E. Homework: Reading the purpose and declaration from the National Archives about Thanksgiving. Completion of 7.2c based on the reading. Students will continue to read their independent reading book for 30 to 35 minutes at night.

Writing Workshop Wednesday: Prewriting, Writing, and Publishing

Objective: Students will be able to develop, explore, and argue a solution to many Americans understanding of Christopher Columbus and other explorers in the 1460-1500s or the purpose and perspective of Thanksgiving in a persuasive essay and other means of communication

A. Do Now: Which topic did you find most surprising and interesting so far during this unit, Christopher Columbus or Thanksgiving? Is there another topic that emerged in our reading about Native Americans that you would like to research more?

B. Check for Understanding: Students will begin to the prewriting process for their persuasive essay. Every student must write a persuasive essay that argues one point with supporting evidence. The student can decide what they will argue based on the previous week's topics.

C. Shared Reading of PSSA Standard Rubric for Essay Writing

D. Shared Writing of Possible Brainstorming for Essay Topics

E. Independent Practice: Prewriting Outline for Possible Essay Topic

F. Exit Ticket: Why did you pick the topic you picked? How will you develop your argument?

G. Homework: Essay outline and prewriting of topic. Student should write as much as they can, research, and reread their sources provided to them in class so they can develop a very strong proficient essay. The more time spent on the essay at home (at least 30 minutes), the student will feel more confident and prepared for class. Students will continue to read their independent reading book for 30 to 35 minutes at night.

Thursday

Objective: Students will be able to read independently for 30 minutes in order to develop RITUAL

Objective: Students will be able to develop, explore, and argue a solution to many Americans understanding of Christopher Columbus and other explorers in the 1460-1500s or the purpose and perspective of Thanksgiving in a persuasive essay and other means of communication

A. Do Now: Students will read their independent reading book for 30 minutes in order to develop RITUAL.

\*Students who do not have their independent reading book can read from their literature textbook. Teacher will have to seek further consequences for the student: assign a detention or call home so that student can be prepared for class.

B. Check for Understanding: Students complete RITUAL log.

C. Check for Understanding: Students will begin to the prewriting process for their persuasive essay. Every student must write a persuasive essay that argues one point with supporting evidence. The student can decide what they will argue based on the previous week's topics.

D. Shared Writing of how to develop a persuasive statement/thesis statement and how to cite information within paragraph and develop a working bibliography

E. Independent Practice: Research of topic, brainstorming/prewriting, outline of topic, and thesis statement. During this time, teacher can have individualized one-on-one writing conference to check in with the student and evaluate the progress.

F. Exit Ticket: Thesis Statement with outline of essay

G. Homework: Essay outline and prewriting of topic. Student should write as much as they can, research, and reread their sources provided to them in class so they can develop a very strong proficient essay. The more time spent on the essay at home (at least 30 minutes), the student will feel more confident and prepared for class. Students will continue to read their independent reading book for 30 to 35 minutes at night.

Friday: Writing, Revising, and Publishing

Objective: Students will be able to develop, explore, and argue a solution to many Americans understanding of Christopher Columbus and other explorers in the 1460-1500s or the purpose and perspective of Thanksgiving in a persuasive essay and other means of communication.

A. Do Now: On a scale of 1-5, 5 being the highest, how strong if your argument and explain why.

B. Check for Understanding: Checklist of what is needed in each of the body paragraphs: Introduction, Body Paragraphs, and Conclusion

C. Shared Reading of Model Essay written by the teacher: During Shared Reading, teacher will highlight and make notes in the margin about the two main arguments in the essay and how the teacher cited textual evidence, used transitional phrases, and provided a solution in the conclusion.

D. Cooperative Pairs and Independent Practice: Students switch essays with his or her cooperative pair for editing, revising, two plusses, and a push. Based on the feedback, students will continue to research and write their essays that are due on Monday. Teacher prefers their essay to be typed with a works cited bibliography that follows APA style. During this time, teacher can have individualized one-on-one writing conference to check in with the student and evaluate the progress.

E. Exit Ticket: Identify one or two changes you made based on the recommendations of your peer and how that helped develop your argument.

F. Homework: Essay outline and prewriting of topic. Student should write as much as they can, research, and reread their sources provided to them in class so they can develop a very strong proficient essay. The more time spent on the essay at home (at least 30

minutes), the student will feel more confident and prepared for class. Students will continue to read their independent reading book for 30 to 35 minutes at night.

### **Unit Three: Here and Now of Native American culture and Activism**

Monday, Tuesday, and Wednesday

Objective: Students will be able to develop, explore, and argue a solution to many Americans (Philadelphia based) about their understanding of Christopher Columbus and other explorers in the 1460-1500s and/or the celebration and observance of Thanksgiving in a persuasive essay and other means of communication

A. Do Now: Students are introduced to the possible topics for the students to pursue.

B. Check for understanding: Teacher reviews with them the objective over and over again and determine the most important elements of the objective and the unit

C. Collaborate with Teacher: Students brainstorm with teacher possible ideas in which they can advocate for the removal of signage and tributes to Christopher Columbus and Thanksgiving.

- Petition

- Facebook page

- Instagram account

- Twitter account

- Bulletin board in the school

- PSA in the morning

- Rally outside school

- Sponsoring a powwow

- Taking younger students to the museum to the exhibit

- Taking parents and siblings to the museum to the exhibit

D. Cooperative Pairs: Students brainstorm with each other possible ideas in which they can advocate for the removal of signage and tributes to Christopher Columbus and Thanksgiving.

E. It is important for students to have the time and space to research possible and unique ways to advocate for a new cause that is unfamiliar to them. If time allows, teacher can find ways to bring in community partners and members from University of Penn to help with implementing their ideas. Resources in most schools are scarce and teachers have difficulty finding time to reach out to community partners. Teachers can contact their school's Home and School Association, parent ombudsman, or the guidance counselor.



## Annotated Bibliography

1. Treuer, Anton, Everything You Wanted to Know About Indians, but Were Afraid to Ask. Borealis Books, Minnesota, 2012.

Treuer is an exceptional writer with very clear cut answers, yet they are many times he mentions in his writings that there isn't one consistent thought shared by Native Americans.

2. Native American Quotes - Great Words From Great Americans. (n.d.). *Native American Quotes - Great Words From Great Americans*. Retrieved June 13, 2014, from <http://www.legendsofamerica.com/na-quotes.html>

Starting the unit with quotes from Native Americans is important because it sets the mood and tone of the unit.

3. Garcia, J. (2005). Early European Explorers. *Creating America: a history of the United States* (). Evanston, Ill.: McDougal Littell.

The social studies textbook enables the student to see the stark contrast between what they read about Native Americans and Columbus to the primary sources.

4. Creech, S. (1994). *Walk two moons*. New York: HarperCollins.

Independent Reading book that is about a young girl who goes on a road trip with her grandparents and discovers her Native American culture.

5. Carter, F., & Strickland, R. (1986/1979). *The education of Little Tree*. Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press.

Forest Carter, the male protagonist, is trying to connect with his Native American heritage by living a simple life and protecting the environment.

6. Alexie, S., & Forney, E. (2007). *The absolutely true diary of a part-time Indian*. New York: Little, Brown.

A young man, Arnold, wants to leave the reservation, go to a different school, avoid powwows, and stop the sufferings of his Native American family and people.

7. Christopher Columbus, "Journal of the First Voyage of Columbus," in Julius E. Olson and Edward Gaylord Bourne, eds., *The Northmen, Columbus and Cabot, 985-1503, Original Narratives of Early American History*. New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1906.

8. Columbus Day, 2008. (2008, October 10). *Columbus Day, 2008*. Retrieved June 13, 2014, from <http://georgewbushwhitehouse.archives.gov/news/releases/2008/10/20081010-5.html>

President George W. Bush address to the American people about Christopher Columbus and his discovery of the new world.

9. Thanksgiving. (n.d.). *History.com*. Retrieved June 13, 2014, from <http://www.history.com/topics/thanksgiving>

Students watch videos about the history behind Thanksgiving and its origins.

## **Resources**

### **Components of Balanced Literacy**

#### **Word Study**

Word Study is the study of our alphabetic symbol system. This involves the areas of phonics (letter/sound relationships), morphemic analysis (using word parts to denote meaning), and automaticity for sight words. Word study involves both the decoding (reading) and encoding (phonics and spelling) of our symbol system so students can make meaning from an author's message and convey meaning by creating their own message.

#### **Interactive Read Aloud**

Interactive Read Aloud is a time when the teacher reads a piece of quality writing aloud to the whole class and stops at planned points to ask questions that elicit student response. Students learn to think deeply about text, to listen to others, and to grow their own ideas.

#### **Shared Reading**

Shared Reading is a type of focus lesson in which either enlarged print is utilized, or all students have the text to "share" the reading process with a group of students. The teacher uses this time, explicitly modeling reading strategies and skills that the students need to learn. The responsibility for reading is "shared" between the teacher and the students, although the teacher reads most of the text.

#### **Strategy Groups**

Strategy Groups are also known as a Guided Reading Groups. The teacher meets with a small group that needs to work on a specific strategy or that has a similar reading level. Each student has a copy of the text and reads it quietly. The teacher uses this time to explicitly teach and to have students practice the strategy they need to learn.

#### **Independent Reading/ Reader's Workshop**

Independent Reading is a time when students read text (either self-selected or teacher recommended) at their Independent Reading level to practice reading strategies, develop fluency and automaticity. The teacher confers with students one-on-one, prompts the use of the strategies, discusses various aspects of the text, and learns about each student as a reader. Students may respond to the text in meaningful ways through writing, discussing, or sketching.

#### **Independent Reading Conference**

An Independent Reading Conference is a time when the teacher works one-on-one with a student to teach the student what s/he needs to learn about reading.

The teacher uses the conference to assess (research) what the student needs to learn, to decide what to teach the student and then to teach the student.

## **Content Standards**

**CC.1.2.7.A:** Determine two or more central ideas in a text and analyze their development over the course of the text; provide an objective summary of the text.

**CC.1.2.7.B:** Cite several pieces of textual evidence to support analysis of what the text says explicitly as well as inferences, conclusions, and/or generalizations drawn from the text.

**CC.1.2.7.D:** Determine an author's point of view or purpose in a text and analyze how the author distinguishes his or her position from that of others.

**CC.1.2.7.G:** Compare and contrast a text to an audio, video, or multimedia version of the text, analyzing each medium's portrayal of the subject (e.g. how the delivery of a speech affects the impact of the words).

## **Appendix**

Name:

Date:

Fact versus Fiction Unit: Primary and Secondary Sources

**Objective: Students will be able to determine and interpret the meaning of unfamiliar words**

**Objective: Students will be able to determine and analyze the main idea of informational pieces both primary and secondary sources in order to provide an objective summary**

A. Do Now: Activate Prior Knowledge: Complete a word association map based on two concepts: stereotypes and reputation

**B. Introduction into New Material: Read the quotes from Native Americans and determine meaning and central idea**

*Luther Standing Bear Oglala Sioux 1868*

*The American Indian is of the soil, whether it be the region of forests, plains, pueblos, or mesas. He fits into the landscape, for the hand that fashioned the continent also fashioned the man for his surroundings. He once grew as naturally as the wild sunflowers, he belongs just as the buffalo belonged....*

**B. Introduction into New Material: Read the quotes from Native Americans and determine meaning and central idea**

*Eagle Chief (Letakos-Lesa) Pawnee*

*All things in the world are two. In our minds we are two, good and evil. With our eyes we see two things, things that are fair and things that are ugly.... We have the right hand that strikes and makes for evil, and we have the left hand full of kindness, near the heart. One foot may lead us to an evil way, the other foot may lead us to a good. So are all things two, all two.*

C. Notes based on discussion of classmates after re-reading the quotes

Name:

Date:

Fact versus Fiction Unit: Primary and Secondary Sources

**Objective: Students will be able to determine and interpret the meaning of unfamiliar words**

**Objective: Students will be able to determine and analyze the main idea of informational pieces both primary and secondary sources in order to provide an objective summary**

A. Do Now: Activate prior knowledge: Define “indigenous” and use it in a sentence with a context clue.

B. Word Study: Preview of text: Pulled lines from *Everything You Wanted to Know About Native Americans but Were Afraid to Ask* by Anton Treuer

1. “Bartolome de las Casas estimated that the **indigenous** population of Espanola, now known as Hispaniola, island of Haiti and the Dominican Republic, was two million people.” (pg 15-16)

a. meaning of the word:

b. context clue

2. “**Archaeological** evidence confirms that the capital city of the Aztec Empire was three times larger than the largest city in all of Western Europe at the time.” (pg 16)

a. meaning of the word:

b. context clue:

“This theory of human origin in the Americas (usually called the **Clovis First Theory**) is now widely challenged in the scientific community.” (pg 17)

a. meaning of the word:

b. context clue:

D. Word Study Check for Understanding: Select one of the vocabulary words and complete a Frayer Model for the word in order for the student to analyze and interpret its meaning.



Name:

Date:

Fact versus Fiction Unit: Primary and Secondary Sources

**Objective: Students will be able to determine and analyze the main idea of informational pieces both primary and secondary sources in order to provide an objective summary**

### **Christopher Columbus 1451-1506**

Original Source: Christopher Columbus, "Journal of the First Voyage of Columbus," in Julius E. Olson and Edward Gaylord Bourne, eds., *The Northmen, Columbus and Cabot, 985-1503, Original Narratives of Early American History*. New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1906.

Sunday, 9 September. Sailed this day nineteen leagues, and determined to count less than the true number, that the crew might not be dismayed if the voyage should prove long. In the night sailed one hundred and twenty miles, at the rate of ten miles an hour, which make thirty leagues. The sailors steered badly, causing the vessels to fall to leeward toward the northeast, for which the Admiral reprimanded them repeatedly.

**Make an inference: How does Columbus feel about his crew?**

Monday, 17 September. Steered west and sailed, day and night, above fifty leagues; wrote down only forty-seven; the current favored them. They saw a great deal of weed which proved to be rockweed, it came from the west and they met with it very frequently. They were of opinion that land was near. The pilots took the sun's amplitude, and found that the needles varied to the northwest a whole point of the compass; the seamen were terrified, and dismayed without saying why. The Admiral discovered the cause, and ordered them to take the amplitude again the next morning, when they found that the needles were true; the cause was that the star moved from its place, while the needles remained stationary.

**The men at sea are trying to locate land. Why are their predictions wrong? Why are they blaming the stars and not themselves?**

Monday, 17 September (continued)...Those on board the Nina ascended the rigging, and all declared they saw land. The Admiral also thought it was land, and about twenty-five leagues distant. They remained all night repeating these affirmations, and the Admiral ordered their course to be shifted from west to southwest where the land appeared to lie. They sailed that day four leagues and a half west and in the night seventeen leagues southwest, in all twenty-one and a half: told the crew thirteen leagues, making it a point to keep them from knowing how far they had sailed; in this manner two reckonings were kept, the shorter one falsified, and the other being the true account. The sea was very smooth and many of the sailors went in it to bathe, saw many dories and other fish.

**There is a recurring theme about how Columbus feels about his crew? Why could this mistrust lead to trouble?**

Thursday, 11 October. At two o'clock in the morning the land was discovered, at two leagues' distance; they took in sail and remained under the square-sail lying to till day, which was Friday, when they found themselves near a small island, one of the Lucayos, called in the Indian language Guanahani. Presently they descried people, naked, and the Admiral landed in the boat, which was armed, along with Martin Alonzo Pinzon, and Vincent Yanez his brother, captain of the Nina. The Admiral bore the royal standard, and the two captains each a banner of the Green Cross, which all the ships had carried; this contained the initials of the names of the King and Queen each side of the cross, and a crown over each letter Arrived on shore, they saw trees very green many streams of water, and diverse sorts of fruits. The Admiral called upon the two Captains, and the rest of the crew who landed, as also to Rodrigo de Escovedo notary of the fleet, and Rodrigo Sanchez, of Segovia, to bear witness that he before all others took possession (as in fact he did) of that island for the King and Queen his sovereigns, making the requisite declarations, which are more at large set down here in writing.

**Identify some of the first actions taken by Columbus and his men once they arrived on land.**

Thursday, 11 October (continued) Numbers of the people of the island straightway collected together. Here follow the precise words of the Admiral: "As I saw that they were very friendly to us, and perceived that they could be much more easily converted to our holy faith by gentle means than by force, I presented them with some red caps, and strings of beads to wear upon the neck, and many other trifles of small value, wherewith they were much delighted, and became wonderfully attached to us. Afterwards they came swimming to the boats, bringing parrots, balls of cotton thread, javelins, and many other things which they exchanged for articles we gave them, such as glass beads, and hawk's bells; which trade was carried on with the utmost good will. But they seemed on the whole to me, to be a very poor people. They all go completely naked, even the women, though I saw but one girl. All whom I saw were young, not above thirty years of age, well made, with fine shapes and faces; their hair short, and coarse like that of a horse's tail, combed toward the forehead, except a small portion which they suffer to hang down behind, and never cut. Some paint themselves with black, which makes them appear like those of the Canaries, neither black nor white; others with white, others with red, and others with such colors as they can find. Some paint the face, and some the whole body; others only the eyes, and others the nose.

**How is Christopher Columbus describing the native people? What type of tone is Columbus starting to set?**

Weapons they have none, nor are acquainted with them, for I showed them swords which they grasped by the blades, and cut themselves through ignorance. They have no iron, their javelins being without it, and nothing more than sticks, though some have fish-bones or other things at the ends. They are all of a good size and stature, and handsomely formed. I saw some with scars of wounds upon their bodies, and demanded by signs the of them; they answered me in the same way, that there came people from the other islands in the neighborhood who endeavored to make prisoners of them, and they defended themselves. I thought then, and still believe, that these were from the continent. It appears to me, that the people are ingenious, and would be good servants and I am of opinion that they would very readily become Christians, as they appear to have no religion.

**How is Christopher Columbus describing the native people? What type of tone is Columbus starting to set?**



RI.7.2b

**Determining two or more central ideas in a text and analyzing their development over the course of the text; providing an objective summary of the text**

**Epiphany Word Bank**

**Analyze**- to break into smaller components and study or examine  
**Central Idea**- the concept, thought, notion, or impression that is of greatest importance in the text or in a portion of the text; it may be implied or explicitly stated  
**Introduce**- the act of providing (someone) with beginning knowledge or first experience with something  
**Develop**-to cause to grow and become more mature, advanced, or elaborate  
**Objective**- not influenced by personal feelings or opinions in considering and representing facts  
**Refine**- to improve by making small changes

	Central idea 1:	Central idea 2:	Central idea 3:
Details that support the introduction of the central idea	Detail that supports the introduction of central idea 1:	Detail that supports the introduction of central idea 2:	Detail that supports the introduction of central idea 3:
Details that support the development of the central idea	Detail that supports the development of central idea 1:	Detail that supports the development of central idea 2:	Detail that supports the development of central idea 3:
Details that support the refinement of the central idea	Detail that supports the refinement of central idea 1:	Detail that supports the refinement of central idea 2:	Detail that supports the refinement of central idea 3:

**Key Ideas and Details (20)**